From: Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <naseem.alston@noaa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, May 16, 2019 7:55 PM

To: Brian Ellrott

Cc: Cathy Marcinkevage; Garwin Yip; Brittany Cunningham - NOAA Affiliate; Howard Brown

Subject: American Division Effects

Hi Brian.

I took a quick look at the section (to be sent to Reclamation tomorrow morning!?)

I found the section very easy to read/follow!

And although it is very clear/concise and has great final conclusions for magnitude of effect, I think it would be helpful to include the proportion of the pop affected within the sections.

See attached. I set some of them up as examples. I see "proportion" is included in the I&S tables so it might work for someone to crosswalk backwards (where did those proportions come from anyway?)

For the Hatchery discussion - please see the attached INTRO section that I asked Amanda to look at and correct - good for this section to reflect that one (or refer to the intro, etc). If time we could ask Amanda to do this comparison (or Brittany?)

I added some suggested text to 2 (?) sections described as uncertain and not consulted on - changed to framework-level (GY/HBd/CMK - please consider taking a look at those as well)

Lastly, I saw a few outstanding comments from Brittany that are addressed to you - so check those out as well!

let me know if you have any questions,

Naseem O. Alston ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce California Central Valley Office Sacramento, CA (916)930-3655 http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/