

---

**From:** J. Stuart - NOAA Federal <j.stuart@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 12, 2019 6:37 AM  
**To:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal; Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal; Kristin Begun - NOAA Affiliate; Howard.Brown; Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal; Cathy Marcinkevage  
**Subject:** Re: FYI -- Delta perf objectives

Also noticed in this current write up that there is no reference to a "baseline" of -5,000 cfs OMR flows during the period of salmon presence - nominally January - June. How does this current write up fit in with all of the other OMR management actions from the original BA? How do we splice all of their actions together, such as the turbidity bridge, and estimate of 5% of a population in the Delta as the start of OMR management, with this "take" section? Does this new element only replace the one bullet of "salvage and loss thresholds" in the 2/5/19 BA version? Looking forward to your clarification.

Jeff

On Wed, Jun 12, 2019 at 5:46 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Barb,

Thanks for putting this together. I added one comment on top of Jeff's version in the loss section, and made a minor edit in the DCC section.

**The comment is:** Can we provide a biological rationale for why this level of loss (and associated far field effects) would help avoid jeopardy? Based on Michel (2018), one could argue that maintaining the status quo would likely contribute to maintaining freshwater survival below population survival levels. There's a lot to unpack there with confounding effects beyond loss at the pumps, but I think there's a strong enough argument such that we should provide a biological rationale for status quo.

On Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 8:52 PM J. Stuart - NOAA Federal <[j.stuart@noaa.gov](mailto:j.stuart@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Please see my comments in the attached document. Answers to these comments will enable me to understand and write a suitable supplement to the PA regarding Reclamation's current position.

On Tue, Jun 11, 2019 at 12:04 PM Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Dear I&S section leads and Delta effects co-leads -- The current (and I think final) Delta performance objectives are described on p. 5-7 of the attached doc -- sharing FYI. The framework, timing, and populations included were decided at the Directors level; Dave Mooney and I just clarified the specifics necessary to calculate the necessary thresholds. My understanding is that I will work with Jeff to add a supplemental analysis of these to the effects section and we will work with the I&S and ITS leads to incorporate into the I&S section and ITS.

The edits to the DCC section (p 4 of the attached) were discussed the week of 5/20 and have already been incorporated into the Delta effects section (but not necessarily the I&S sections, since those weren't prepared for peer review).

ALERT: The Shasta performance objectives are still pending edits and agreement -- the draft objectives in the attached doc may yet be revised.

--

**Barb Byrne**

Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: 916-930-5612  
[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

**Jeffrey S. Stuart, M.S.**

*Fishery Biologist*  
  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814-4706

Office: 916-930-3607  
[J.Stuart@noaa.gov](mailto:J.Stuart@noaa.gov)



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Jeffrey S. Stuart, M.S.**  
*Fishery Biologist*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814-4706*

Office: 916-930-3607

[J.Stuart@noaa.gov](mailto:J.Stuart@noaa.gov)



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

