
From: Google Docs <d+MTAzNzY3NjkzNTI4ODM2ODQ1MTlw@docs.google.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 27, 2018 9:20 AM
To: evan.sawyer@noaa.gov
Subject: 20181116_ROC Proposed Action_NOAA_(internal)

Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal and J. Stuart - NOAA Federal added comments to [20181116_ROC Proposed Action_NOAA_\(internal\)](#)

New

8 comments

New

Comments

 **Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal**

cold water pools

This is approach is currently not working to conserve cold water pool in Whiskeytown.

ReplyOpen

 **Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal**

and CVPIA 3406(b)(12)

Evan, sorry I just resolved you comment here and can't seem to get it back. You were defining B12. I also think B1 (AFRP) and B2 would be appropriate here.

ReplyOpen

 **J. Stuart - NOAA Federal**

Delta Smelt ("First Flush") - After December 1, and when 3-day average turbidity is 12 NTU or greater at Prisoner's Point, Holland Cut, and Victoria Canal.

So if on Dec 1 we hit a turbidity trigger, the OMR is limited to be more positive than -5000 cfs for the rest of the season (i.e. Dec through June)?

ReplyOpen

 **J. Stuart - NOAA Federal**

After May 15

Why this date? Also how will you determine the 5% of the population? SJ River steelhead catches are infrequent and you won't know what 5% of the catch is until the end of the year - it could be 1 fish for most years since annual catch is frequently less than 20 SH in a given year, and that is likely to happen before May 15 of a given year.

ReplyOpen

 **J. Stuart - NOAA Federal**

five percent (5%)

How is this measured? DOSS estimates of fish distribution? Why April 1? most spring run are past KL by this date and are already in the Delta as seen in the fish salvage records. Also, this is the period of time when FRCS hatchery releases are occurring which obliterates the ability to really determine FR from SR with any level of certainty. My analysis of KL data based on the RST catches show that in 50% of years, 25% of the annual SR catch occurs by Jan 1.

ReplyOpen

J. Stuart - NOAA Federal

more than five percent (5%)

See Barb's comment and how will the 5% of population be determined? Is this the DOSS estimate, or some other metric of evaluation? No details, so hard to really understand how they will do it. Also, looking at historical data from KL RSTs, 5% of the WR population has past the KL location way before January 1, I've looked at WY 2001 through WY 2012, and 75% of the time, 25% of the WR population (as measured by the percentage of annual catch at KL) has passed KL by Jan 1.

ReplyOpen

Evan Sawyer - NOAA Federal

CVPIA 3406(b)(12).

CVPIA "(12) Develop and implement a comprehensive program to provide flows to allow sufficient spawning, incubation, rearing, and outmigration for salmon and steelhead from Whiskeytown Dam as determined by instream flow studies conducted by the California Department of Fish and Game after Clear Creek has been restored and a new fish ladder has been constructed at the McCormick-Saeltzer Dam."

Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal

and B2 (Water) and B1 AFRP

Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal

Marked as resolved

ReplyOpen

Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal

Since water released for dilution of toxic spills is likely to be in excess of other CVP requirements, such releases increase the risk of a loss of water for other beneficial purposes.

Same conclusion as 2004.

ReplyOpen

Google LLC, 1600 Amphitheatre Parkway, Mountain View, CA 94043, USA

You have received this email because you are a participant in the updated discussion threads. [Change what Google Docs sends you.](#) You can not reply to this email.

Google™