From: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov>

**Sent:** Friday, March 22, 2019 5:12 PM **To:** Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal

**Subject:** Re: For review: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach

Hi Rosalie --

Sorry I didn't get these to you sooner. I tried to merge the NOA and MR reviews and it got VERY weird to where i couldn't see comments (I think Maria used her ipad which can introduce hiccups). So, sorry I can't provide you with one copy with both sets of comments.

But I have attached here two things:

- 1) Naseem's review (also with some work from Susan on editing)
- 2) Maria's review.

I recommend you build off of Naseem's review for yours.

These are both on the server, too. You can either send yours back or save to the server with your initials appended.

S:\Draft BiOp\2 ESA\2.1 Analytical Approach

Let me know if you have any questions!

Thanks!

Cathy

On Fri, Mar 22, 2019 at 9:13 AM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal < rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov > wrote: Yes, my noble intent was to complete my review before the course, but was busy reviewing FCRPS... And have been using my evenings this week to prepare for the course.

Yes, if it's helpful, I can provide my comments on other reviewers' comments, so feel free to send.

Thanks

Rosalie

On Fri, Mar 22, 2019 at 9:05 AM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <<u>cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov</u>> wrote:

Thanks for the update. I knew you were off site this week but wasn't sure if you'd fit it in before the course.

I have markups from Naseem and Maria. Would you like to see a copy with those comments already in it? I can try to merge (but may lose some of the graying out of "resolved" comments because Maria's went wonky).

I've also got a few verbal comments from Steve Lindley and expect him to send a email with review notes in the next few days. I can relay the gist if you want.

Thanks! Cathy

On Mar 22, 2019, at 8:37 AM, Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Cathy,

My apologies for the delay in providing comments on the revised analytical approach. I've been teaching NCTC section 7 course to Sacramento colleagues at FWS and COE (Civil works) all week and have not been able to complete my review of the analytical approach. I plan to get my comments to you by Monday.

Thanks.

Rosalie

On Tue, Mar 19, 2019 at 3:51 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov> wrote:

Thanks, Naseem.

All, wearing my Garwin hat, I offer a gentle reminder that we'd like your review of this section by COB Wednesday.

Cathy

On Mar 19, 2019, at 3:43 PM, Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <naseem.alston@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Garwin,

I have saved my review onto the drive with my initials. R:\Draft BiOp\2 ESA\2.1 Analytical Approach

## and consider it Cleared for CVO division S7 review

Naseem O. Alston ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce California Central Valley Office Sacramento, CA (916)930-3655 http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/

On Thu, Mar 14, 2019 at 9:26 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <garwin.vip@noaa.gov> wrote:

All,

Please see Cathy's e-mail, below, for explanations and instructions. Previous reviewers for targeted reviews include Erin, Rosalie, Brian, and me. Props to Cathy and Evan for putting the section together

Please send back any track changes by COB next Wednesday, March 20.

Maria, Naseem, Rosalie, and Chris: When you send back any track changes, please indicate whether you're clearing the document with the revisions, or whether you need to see it again.

Thanks.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce California Central Valley Office 650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100 Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611 Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



----- Forwarded message -----

From: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal

<<u>cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov</u>>

Date: Wed, Mar 13, 2019 at 11:23 PM

Subject: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach

To: Garwin Yip <<u>garwin.yip@noaa.gov</u>>
Cc: Boring, Susan <<u>susan boring@fws.gov</u>>

Garwin ---

For you to transmit to reviewers (Howard, Maria, Rosalie, (Naseem?) and perhaps Chris).

Attached is the draft Section 2.1 Analytical Approach for the ROC LTO for your review. I recommend that you "Save As" with your initials appended to the filename.

Please note that there are a number of items that are not ripe for finalization and await updates that won't be ready until alter. I have flagged these in yellow comments.

There are no track changes on this version, but I have retained comments for you to see your previous reviews. In many cases,I have marked these comments "done" and faded them, and in several I have also responded. Comments that are not faded still require some attention.

Comments in blue can generally be ignored by you; these are for tech editor and reference manager.

Thanks - Cathy

--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.
Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
Office: (562) 980-4085
Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov
www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.
Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
Office: (562) 980-4085
Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov
www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov

