

---

**From:** Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, March 26, 2019 3:29 PM  
**To:** Rosalie del Rosario  
**Subject:** Fwd: For review: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach

----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** **Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal** <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)>  
**Date:** Tue, Mar 26, 2019 at 2:59 PM  
**Subject:** Re: For review: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach  
**To:** Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)>, Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)>, Barbara Byrne <[Barbara.Byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:Barbara.Byrne@noaa.gov)>, Howard Brown <[Howard.Brown@noaa.gov](mailto:Howard.Brown@noaa.gov)>, 'Maria.rea@noaa.gov' <[Maria.rea@noaa.gov](mailto:Maria.rea@noaa.gov)>, Christopher Keifer <[Christopher.Keifer@noaa.gov](mailto:Christopher.Keifer@noaa.gov)>, <[susan\\_boring@fws.gov](mailto:susan_boring@fws.gov)>

Hi,

I offer comments on the analytical approach for your consideration. Also attaching a powerpoint file with suggested graphs to represent categories of magnitude of effect as described in general text on page 34, and can be modified to illustrate the full range of effects from the relationships between severity v proportion exposed, and severity v frequency of exposure.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,  
Rosalie

On Tue, Mar 19, 2019 at 3:51 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Thanks, Naseem.

All, wearing my Garwin hat, I offer a gentle reminder that we'd like your review of this section by COB Wednesday.

Cathy

On Mar 19, 2019, at 3:43 PM, Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Garwin,

I have saved my review onto the drive with my initials.  
R:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA\2.1 Analytical Approach

**and consider it Cleared for CVO division S7 review**

Naseem O. Alston  
ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
Sacramento, CA  
(916)930-3655  
<http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/>

On Thu, Mar 14, 2019 at 9:26 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

All,

Please see Cathy's e-mail, below, for explanations and instructions. Previous reviewers for targeted reviews include Erin, Rosalie, Brian, and me. Props to Cathy and Evan for putting the section together

Please send back any track changes by COB next Wednesday, March 20.

**Maria, Naseem, Rosalie, and Chris:** When you send back any track changes, please indicate whether you're clearing the document with the revisions, or whether you need to see it again.

Thanks.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*  
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal** <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)>  
Date: Wed, Mar 13, 2019 at 11:23 PM  
Subject: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach

To: Garwin Yip <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)>  
Cc: Boring, Susan <[susan\\_boring@fws.gov](mailto:susan_boring@fws.gov)>

Garwin --

For you to transmit to reviewers (Howard, Maria, Rosalie, (Naseem?) and perhaps Chris).

Attached is the draft Section 2.1 Analytical Approach for the ROC LTO for your review. ***I recommend that you "Save As" with your initials appended to the filename.***

Please note that there are a number of items that are not ripe for finalization and await updates that won't be ready until later. I have flagged these in yellow comments.

There are no track changes on this version, but I have retained comments for you to see your previous reviews. In many cases, I have marked these comments "done" and faded them, and in several I have also responded. Comments that are not faded still require some attention.

Comments in blue can generally be ignored by you; these are for tech editor and reference manager.

Thanks -  
Cathy

--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

