From: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, March 27, 2019 10:52 PM **To:** Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal

Subject: Re: For review: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach

Rosalie --

Thanks for the thoughtful review -- I'm working through it all now.

On p. 36, you started a comment, but looks like you didn't finish. It only contains "I recommend a". Is there more to that or was it covered in another comment?

Thanks!

Cathy

On Tue, Mar 26, 2019 at 3:07 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal < rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov > wrote: Hi Cathy and Garwin,

Sorry, forgot to state I'd like to see the revision again before clearing it. I'd like to review the section on magnitude of effects to make sure it's clear to the reader because it is fundamental to the effects analyses. Thanks,

Rosalie

On Tue, Mar 26, 2019 at 3:03 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal < cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov wrote:

Thanks, Rosalie!

On Tue, Mar 26, 2019 at 2:59 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <<u>rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov</u>> wrote:

Hi,

I offer comments on the analytical approach for your consideration. Also attaching a powerpoint file with suggested graphs to represent categories of magnitude of effect as described in general text on page 34, and can be modified to illustrate the full range of effects from the relationships between severity v proportion exposed, and severity v frequency of exposure.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,

Rosalie

On Tue, Mar 19, 2019 at 3:51 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal < cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov wrote:

Thanks, Naseem.

All, wearing my Garwin hat, I offer a gentle reminder that we'd like your review of this section by COB Wednesday.

Cathy

On Mar 19, 2019, at 3:43 PM, Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <naseem.alston@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Garwin,

I have saved my review onto the drive with my initials. R:\Draft BiOp\2 ESA\2.1 Analytical Approach

and consider it Cleared for CVO division S7 review

Naseem O. Alston ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce California Central Valley Office Sacramento, CA (916)930-3655 http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/

On Thu, Mar 14, 2019 at 9:26 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <<u>garwin.yip@noaa.gov</u>> wrote:

All,

Please see Cathy's e-mail, below, for explanations and instructions. Previous reviewers for targeted reviews include Erin, Rosalie, Brian, and me. Props to Cathy and Evan for putting the section together

Please send back any track changes by COB next Wednesday, March 20.

Maria, Naseem, Rosalie, and Chris: When you send back any track changes, please indicate whether you're clearing the document with the revisions, or whether you need to see it again.

Thanks.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611 Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



----- Forwarded message -----

From: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal < cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov >

Date: Wed, Mar 13, 2019 at 11:23 PM

Subject: ROC LTO Section 2.2 Analytical Approach

To: Garwin Yip <<u>garwin.yip@noaa.gov</u>>
Cc: Boring, Susan <<u>susan_boring@fws.gov</u>>

Garwin --

For you to transmit to reviewers (Howard, Maria, Rosalie, (Naseem?) and perhaps Chris).

Attached is the draft Section 2.1 Analytical Approach for the ROC LTO for your review. I recommend that you "Save As" with your initials appended to the filename.

Please note that there are a number of items that are not ripe for finalization and await updates that won't be ready until alter. I have flagged these in yellow comments.

There are no track changes on this version, but I have retained comments for you to see your previous reviews. In many cases,I have marked these comments "done" and faded them, and in several I have also responded. Comments that are not faded still require some attention.

Comments in blue can generally be ignored by you; these are for tech editor and reference manager.

Thanks -Cathy

--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.

Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

Office: (562) 980-4085

Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.
Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
Office: (562) 980-4085
Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov
www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov

