

---

**From:** Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <barbara.byrne@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Sunday, June 16, 2019 5:50 PM  
**To:** Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** J. Stuart  
**Subject:** Re: Delta section with supplemental analysis

I don't think the 2009 ITLs were very limiting, so loss thresholds less than 2009 ITLs not necessarily limiting.

I do think that the final PA loss thresholds (based on historical loss, so quite a bit less than the 2009 ITLs) will result in less direct loss than under the original PA loss thresholds, but there is uncertainty about overall far-field as noted in the supplemental analysis since unclear what OMR will result under the final PA.

On Sun, Jun 16, 2019 at 5:25 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
OK, looking now.

I got to thinking about the supplemental Delta analysis last night. I don't need a long explanation, but even if Reclamation decides to conduct a risk assessment and shine off -3,500 cfs and/or -2,500 cfs OMR, would the new loss thresholds result in less OMR effect because the annual and cumulative loss thresholds are lower than the 2009 ITLs?

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*  
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Sun, Jun 16, 2019 at 5:18 PM Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Thanks, Garwin. Current master doc on server (and attached, in case either of you are having VPN trouble) is:  
*2.5 and 2.6 Delta Effects V16 MASTER--GY--BB.doc*

I did the following:

1. Reviewed your edits(didn't accept yet so Jeff can review easily in combo with my few new revisions); am good with all but:

--suggestion to flag supplemental analysis at end of original analysis (since readers may be spot-reading BiOp, I think important to flag at the top of the key sections so left it there at the top of each section with a Level 5 heading related to OMR management. Thought about adding to end, but "end" of section is usually specific to some sub-PA component -- the top is more clear for an "overarching" comment unless I add an explicit summary section which would require a lot of new text.)

--one edit referring to OMR under the COS, final PA, and revised PA (not sure what you meant by revised PA so rejected your edits and just kept the original comparison between final PA and COS)

2. Responded to all comments (either with new text, or noted why no edit needed).

3. Wordsmithed CH table text on p. 241 and 248 from "partially mitigated in final PA by loss thresholds" to "lesser effect in final PA due to revised loss thresholds."

On Sat, Jun 15, 2019 at 11:10 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Good job.

See attached for my track changes (disposition in red, below). Main comment was whether the base Delta effects section utilized the original Feb.5 PA, or the April 30 revised PA. If the latter, we should insert a middle column in the table that compares and contrasts the differences in the PAs (great table, by the way).

I added a sentence associated with the programmatic nature of the steelhead life cycle monitoring plan. Please search for programmatic treatment of other PA components, and make sure that there is a general effects statement (e.g., beneficial or adverse) so it can be considered in our jeopardy analysis.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611

Cell: 916-716-6558

FAX: 916-930-3629

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Sat, Jun 15, 2019 at 1:27 PM Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Subject doc attached--this V16 MASTER doc includes my and Jeff's edits in track changes; I have accepted all of Susan's formatting/citation edits. Send back any edits and I'll drop the updated file on the ROCON drive.

Edits are at:

Effects to species:

p. 76 -- caveat for "old" OMR management analysis--**see comment**

p. 80 -- caveat for "old" South Delta ops analysis--**see comment**  
p. 147-158 -- primary supplemental Delta analysis section (*Note that the introductory paragraph was grabbed from the Shasta section that Cathy drafted; I'll send Cathy the final version in the Delta for her to consider for the Shasta section since we agreed they should be basically the same*)--**I accepted the track changes before starting my own.**  
p.222 -- Table 2.5.5-61 (DCC effects) --**No comments**

#### Effects to CH

p. 235 -- DCC tweaks--**edits**  
p. 241 -- edit to CVP/SWP Export facilities row in CH for salmonids table--**edit**  
p. 245 -- edit in GS discussion re: loss thresholds--**edits**  
p. 248 -- edit to CVP/SWP Export facilities row in CH for GS table--**edit**  
**\*\*Edits on p. 241 and 248 add "partially mitigated by loss thresholds in revised PA." to the response column; is "mitigated" an okay term to use here? \*\* I was gonna wordsmith that, as I don't think it's an appropriate word in that context. Thought about "reduce," but I think we have "reduce" at the beginning of the cell.**

#### Looked at but didn't think edits needed given original qualitative assessment.

p. 228 -- Table 2.5.5-66 (South Delta Export operations) on p. 232  
p. 240 -- DCC Gate ops row of CH table

--

#### **Barb Byrne**

Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: 916-930-5612  
[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814



#### Find us online

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

#### **Barb Byrne**

Fish Biologist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: 916-930-5612  
[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)  
California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

**Barb Byrne**

Fish Biologist

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Office: 916-930-5612

[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)

*California Central Valley Office*

*650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100*

*Sacramento, CA 95814*



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

