

---

**From:** Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <joe.heublein@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Friday, April 19, 2019 9:35 AM  
**To:** Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal  
**Subject:** Re: recovery in integration and synthesis  
**Attachments:** 2.5 and 2.6 Delta V3.docx; 2.5 and 2.6 Upper Sac Effects V7.docx

Hi Rosalie,

Please see attached draft effects sections for the Delta and Shasta divisions. I didn't send tables and figures as the files are pretty large but let me know and I can try to send those also.

How does 11:30 work for a call to discuss?

Thanks again,

Joe

On Fri, Apr 19, 2019 at 8:33 AM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Joe,  
Please send me the word docs.  
Thanks  
Rosalie

On Apr 18, 2019, at 4:31 PM, Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Rosalie,

Do you have access to R:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA in the CVP ROCON drive? Otherwise I can send you word copies of the Shasta and Delta division draft effects. I'll look at your calendar tomorrow for time for a call

Thanks

Joe

On Thu, Apr 18, 2019 at 4:11 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Joe,  
Thanks for sending the draft. Do you have a draft of the effects analysis section that I could look at? I'm wondering how the tables in the I&S relate to the effects analysis section. Also, I'd like to discuss some of my initial comments with you over the phone so will look for some time on your calendar. in the meantime, I will continue to review the draft I&S and provide written comments.

Thanks,  
Rosalie

On Thu, Apr 18, 2019 at 9:31 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Rosalie,

Things are a bit backed up in our office review and we were hoping you could review the green sturgeon I&S. I've attached the most recent section and it's also available on the server under the same title-

R:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA\2.8-2.9 Integration and Synthesis and Conclusion

Thanks

Joe

On Tue, Apr 16, 2019 at 10:27 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Rosalie,

Thanks for the example, I followed a similar approach in the green sturgeon section I&S for ROC LTO but made more specific reference to criteria in the recovery plan. Not sure if we closed the loop on your review but maybe we should stick with the schedule and wait until the CVO has a chance to review the I&S sections.

Thanks again

Joe

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 3:59 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Joe,

Good topic and I think a brief call can be effective. I don't have a template to offer, but attached is an example biop that was shared with me that addresses recovery more explicitly (see highlights). Keep the context in mind. It's for a simpler project than ROConLTO but nevertheless helpful. I also provided comments on the draft analytical approach re: analyzing likelihood of recovery under the jeopardy standard. I recommend the analysis for each species speak directly to the recovery criteria identified in the recovery plan.

McElhany's VSP is for population-specific and the recovery criteria describe what the species needs to be recovered. Again, probably best to have a brief call. My calendar is updated.

Thanks,

Rosalie

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 9:38 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Rosalie,

Naseem shared these thoughts on discussion of recovery criteria in integration and synthesis. Brian and I would like to have a brief call on how to incorporate a discussion of recovery criteria into the ROC LTO BO integration and synthesis section and check if you have any recent example paragraphs or templates on discussion of recovery criteria in I&S

we can use. Our I&S section is due this Friday so if you can send any recent examples or templates in advance of our call that would be great.

Thanks

Joe

--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629

[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



