

---

**From:** Howard Brown - NOAA Federal <howard.brown@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 16, 2019 11:57 AM  
**To:** Maria Rea; Cathy Marcinkevage; Garwin Yip; Evan Sawyer - NOAA Affiliate; Barbara Byrne  
**Subject:** Fwd: ROC NMFS Sacramento and Delta Effects Discussion

Folks, here are my comments/additions in red text regarding the action items from yesterday. Please send me your comments/edits if you think there are missing components or a need for clarification.  
Howawrd

1. Reclamation: **Provide more specificity regarding how the PA actions and approaches contribute to higher storage levels compared to historic and COS including:** provide NMFS information on how to move off of historical reservoir levels without the PA by showing historical fall flows and circumstances controlling them over the last 9-10 years and then look at comparative analysis what's being proposed in the proposed action qualitative – by Friday
2. Reclamation: draft language to revise the proposed action on implementation of Fall X2 – clarify priorities – want to be transparent and upfront about decision making and then – opportunity for NMFS technical assistance and advice – send over by Friday
3. Reclamation to provide an additional column to the uncertainties table **to address how Reclamation's proposed clarifications address the uncertainties or assumptions**
4. Reclamation to provide additional science on temperatures beyond the EPA criteria from the Pacific Northwest **regarding Clear Creek temperatures**
5. For non-flow measures, Reclamation to provide historical appropriations data and CVPIA information. Frame up a commitment in the T&C to annually discuss the actions and prepare projects for consideration of funding.
6. NMFS: Summary of effects tables – NMFS reviews for language to be more clear
7. NMFS to consider "hockey stick" in discussion of OMR changes and Reclamation to look at changes from positive to negative.
8. NMFS to consider how a shift to salvage rolls up, including indirect effects.
9. Delta salvage: Barb and Dave working on things **specific to Delta salvage and loss performance measures**
10. NMFS: editing analysis to correct salvage vs loss
11. Reclamation to describe the differences between the COS and PA for the American River planning minimum.
12. Reclamation to provide list of detailed comments by Thursday
13. Reclamation to provide red-line text edits by Friday
- 14. NMFS (Howard) to provide initial framework document for Collaborative Planning Implementation Strategy.**

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Mooney, David** <[dmmooney@usbr.gov](mailto:dmmooney@usbr.gov)>

Date: Wed, May 15, 2019 at 10:49 PM

Subject: ROC NMFS Sacramento and Delta Effects Discussion

To: Howard Brown <[howard.brown@noaa.gov](mailto:howard.brown@noaa.gov)>

Cc: Evan Sawyer - NOAA Federal <[evan.sawyer@noaa.gov](mailto:evan.sawyer@noaa.gov)>, Barbara Byrne <[Barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:Barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)>, Garwin Yipp <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)>, Jeffrey Rieker <[jrieker@usbr.gov](mailto:jrieker@usbr.gov)>, Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <[maria.rea@noaa.gov](mailto:maria.rea@noaa.gov)>, Kristin White <[knwhite@usbr.gov](mailto:knwhite@usbr.gov)>, Derya Sumer <[dsumer@usbr.gov](mailto:dsumer@usbr.gov)>, Dan Castleberry <[dan\\_castleberry@fws.gov](mailto:dan_castleberry@fws.gov)>, Russell Callejo <[rcallejo@usbr.gov](mailto:rcallejo@usbr.gov)>, Cynthia Meyer <[cameyer@usbr.gov](mailto:cameyer@usbr.gov)>, Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)>, <[j.stuart@noaa.gov](mailto:j.stuart@noaa.gov)>, Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)>, Hilts, Derek <[derek\\_hilts@fws.gov](mailto:derek_hilts@fws.gov)>, Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)>, Naseem Alston <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)>

Howard,

Here's what we recorded for action items.

1. Reclamation: provide NMFS information on how to move off of historical reservoir levels without the PA by showing historical fall flows and circumstances controlling them over the last 9-10 years and then look at comparative analysis what's being proposed in the proposed action qualitative – by Friday
2. Reclamation: draft language to revise the proposed action on implementation of Fall X2 – clarify priorities – want to be transparent and upfront about decision making and then – opportunity for NMFS technical assistance and advice – send over by Friday
3. Reclamation to provide an additional column to the uncertainties table
4. Reclamation to provide additional science on temperatures beyond the EPA criteria from the Pacific Northwest.
5. For non-flow measures, Reclamation to provide historical appropriations data and CVPIA information. Frame up a commitment in the T&C to annually discuss the actions and prepare projects for consideration of funding.
6. NMFS: Summary of effects tables – NMFS reviews for language to be more clear
7. NMFS to consider "hockey stick" in discussion of OMR changes and Reclamation to look at changes from positive to negative.
8. NMFS to consider how a shift to salvage rolls up, including indirect effects.
9. Delta salvage: Barb and Dave working on things
10. NMFS: editing analysis to correct salvage vs loss
11. Reclamation to describe the differences between the COS and PA for the American River planning minimum.
12. Reclamation to provide list of detailed comments by Thursday
13. Reclamation to provide red-line text edits by Friday

Please let me know if we missed something or got something wrong.

Take care.

Dave

David Mooney, Ph.D., P.E.  
Bay-Delta Office Area Manager  
Mid-Pacific Region, U.S. Bureau of Reclamation

801 I Street, Suite 140 (BDO-100)  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[dmmooney@usbr.gov](mailto:dmmooney@usbr.gov)  
(916) 414-2401 (Office)  
(916) 200-9214 (Mobile)

--

**Howard L. Brown**  
*Policy Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries, West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
(916) 930-3608  
[Howard.Brown@noaa.gov](mailto:Howard.Brown@noaa.gov)



[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)