

---

**From:** Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <joe.heublein@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 23, 2019 11:15 AM  
**To:** Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal  
**Subject:** Re: I&S sections

Hi Garwin,

'Advect' is not included in either GS or SH I&S. The entrainment discussion is pretty high level in the GS and SH I&S but we'll have to rely on the various reviews and hope the discussion is OK. .

-Joe

On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 11:00 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

2 things I remember from Maria:

- Don't use "advect." Change to a synonym. That happened in the Delta Division effects section.
- Sensitivity in how we characterize juvenile entrainment into the central and south Delta. I forget what the trigger words were, but Maria is VERY sensitive to it.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611

Cell: 916-716-6558

FAX: 916-930-3629

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 10:24 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Garwin,

I only found 6 comments from Maria the W-R I&S, generally speaking they are addressed in steelhead and GS (e.g., reference latest status reviews, discuss recovery). We could potentially add a sentence on underestimates of loss from W-R that Brian added per one of Maria's comments-

The loss estimates presented in Table 2.8.1-2 do not include loss due to louver cleaning and do not include predation observed to occur on the upstream side of the TFCF trash racks (Vogel 2010), and therefore underestimate mortality associated with CVP/SWP fish salvage facilities.

On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 10:13 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Joe,

Maybe you can search the WR I&S section for Maria's comments, and how Brian addressed them. Maria was OK with us sending the other I&S sections out to Reclamation PROVIDED THAT her comments were incorporated in the other I&S sections.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*  
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 9:25 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Garwin,

My status is similar to Brian's-

All comments (Rosalie's, yours, Jeff's) were at least attempted to be addressed with revisions (comment bubble responses in some describing revision). I haven't looked at Maria's w-r comments so can't speak to how those were incorporated in SH or GS. Some division leads have reviewed the tables but I haven't gotten final confirmation, I'll send an email to division leads now that probably won't be immediately responded to.

-Joe

On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 8:21 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:



On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 9:42 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

See red, below.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 6:56 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
How about sending both the track changes and the clean versions? **Yup**

The track changes w-r version is in the archive folder as this: 2.8 Integration and Synthesis ELLROTT WR V3 track changes

Clean w-r version is the one in the main folder.

Can you add your edits to both versions? **Yup**

Lastly, are you sending them to Maria and Rosalie or are Joe and I supposed to do that? **Me**

On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 6:20 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
As crazy as the track changes versions are, let's send those. That way the reviewers can see their comments and how they were addressed. Hold off on looking at winter-run. I made a few edits on the version on my laptop that I need to put back in the ROCON drive. Same goes for GS.

Sent from my iPhone

On May 23, 2019, at 6:12 AM, Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:

I need to do add the J/Adverse mod tables back in to winter-run before it can go to Maria and Rosalie for review. I'm confident all comments (Rosalie's, Maria's, yours) in the text were at least attempted to be addressed, slightly less certain about the effects tables as I've relied on the division leads to own those. And I'll do a quick cross-walk of Maria's comments to make sure.

Spring-run will be ready later today.

On Wed, May 22, 2019 at 11:48 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal

<[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Upon my final review and clean up for distribution to Reclamation, are all of them ready to send back to Rosalie for review and clearance (and Maria for winter-run)? Maria also wanted confirmation (from me) that her comments in the WR I&S section were addressed in the others. Confirm?

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611

Cell: 916-716-6558

FAX: 916-930-3629

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)

