

---

**From:** Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 19, 2018 12:50 PM  
**To:** Maria Rea; Garwin Yip; Howard Brown; Brian Ellrott; Naseem.Alston  
**Subject:** Baseline Figures

All --

Earlier this morning, Garwin, Howard, Maria, and I talked about the baseline. We went back to the baseline figures from the OCAP and CWF opinions to try to visually ID how all of the parts layer on each other, and to show how their "without action" won't jive with what we need to do.

Attached is a document with all these together, including:

- NMFS 2009 BiOp Figure
- USFWS 2008 BiOp Approach
- NMFS CWF Figure
- My attempt to make a similar figure showing their "Without Action" baseline
- My attempt to make a similar figure showing how we would tackle this in our BiOp

If we can nail down the last two, we thought that they could be good to have either 1) with us during our Friday "elevation" meeting with Paul and maybe 2) to include in the memo that is being drafted.

Off to chat more about it with Rec....but let me know what you think!

Cathy