

---

**From:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, December 19, 2018 2:44 PM  
**To:** Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** Garwin Yip; Howard Brown; Maria Rea - NOAA Federal; Naseem.Alston  
**Subject:** Re: Baseline Figures

Agreed. This is super helpful Cathy! See attached for a comment on the last figure. Feel free to call if you want to talk it over.

Brian

On Wed, Dec 19, 2018 at 2:11 PM Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <[maria.rea@noaa.gov](mailto:maria.rea@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Cathy, I would suggest bringing copies of this to the meeting on Friday. Thank you for working on this!  
- Maria

**Maria Rea**  
Assistant Regional Administrator, California Central Valley Office  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
(916) 930-3600  
[Maria.Rea@noaa.gov](mailto:Maria.Rea@noaa.gov)



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Wed, Dec 19, 2018 at 12:50 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)> wrote:

All --

Earlier this morning, Garwin, Howard, Maria, and I talked about the baseline. We went back to the baseline figures from the OCAP and CWF opinions to try to visually ID how all of the parts layer on each other, and to show how their "without action" won't jive with what we need to do.

Attached is a document with all these together, including:

- NMFS 2009 BiOp Figure
- USFWS 2008 BiOp Approach

- NMFS CWF Figure
- My attempt to make a similar figure showing their "Without Action" baseline
- My attempt to make a similar figure showing how we would tackle this in our BiOp

If we can nail down the last two, we thought that they could be good to have either 1) with us during our Friday "elevation" meeting with Paul and maybe 2) to include in the memo that is being drafted.

Off to chat more about it with Rec....but let me know what you think!

Cathy

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)