
From: Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <maria.rea@noaa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, February 28, 2019 6:18 PM
To: paul_souza@fws.gov; Dan Castleberry; Kaylee Allen; Barry Thom - NOAA Federal; Howard Brown; Cathy Marcinkevage; Garwin Yip
Subject: Fwd: Adaptive management discussion tomorrow
Attachments: Untitled attachment 00165.html; Proposed Final Adaptive Management Program CLEAN.docx; TandC_6_CWF_Final_BiOp.pdf; Untitled attachment 00168.html; ba-appendix-c-roc-water-operations-charter.pdf; Untitled attachment 00171.html

Paul, Barry et al -

I understand from Howard that the primary focus of the fish agencies discussion tomorrow will be briefing up to both of you in order to elevate adaptive management discussion with Reclamation. My understanding is that the meetings on this topic with Dave Mooney to date have not gone well, but that Russ has indicated a willingness to reach agreement that is closer to past five agency products, as long as Cal Water Fix can be excised from these docs.

I am forwarding some background from Cathy below, as well as the foundational documents that we will be discussing.

Howard or Cathy - feel free to add more formal agenda...just wanted to get these out this evening in case Paul or Barry wanted to skim the docs.

- Maria

Sent from my iPad

Begin forwarded message:

From: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov>
Date: February 28, 2019 at 2:38:59 PM PST
To: Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <maria.rea@noaa.gov>
Cc: Evan Sawyer - NOAA Affiliate <evan.sawyer@noaa.gov>, Howard Brown <Howard.Brown@noaa.gov>, Garwin Yip <garwin.yip@noaa.gov>, Barbara Byrne <Barbara.Byrne@noaa.gov>
Subject: Re: Adaptive management discussion tomorrow

Maria --

Attached are the AM-related documents that you requested to go into tomorrow's directors call on ROC. They include:

- The Five-Agency AMP.
- Term and Condition 6 from the CWF BiOp.
- ROC LTO BA Appendix C (Real-Time Water Operations Charter)

I have not attached the proposed action (BA Ch. 4) but can send that if you need it.

Points of note:

- -See Table 4.6 of the BA. There are several project components that they have noted as "AM", but Rec has made clear that "AM" there does not mean AM in the traditional sense. My take is that they are more "optional, experimental" things that they MAY do and that they would like worked into the jeopardy analysis (despite the uncertainty of effect). There is no certainty of them occurring.
- -Nowhere does App C or the PA refer to the five-agency AMP, and Dave Mooney said that Reclamation does not support that because it is associated with CWF.
- -However, they have not identified an alternative process that shows:
 - - Includes Full AM cycle
 - - Process to incrementally reduce uncertainty (not willy nilly ops)
 - - Clear protocols for communication and transparency
 - - Clear opportunities and protocols for stakeholder involvement
 - - Collaborative and consistent decision making process
 - - Deference to regulatory authority on final decision
- We feel they are therefore skipping the setup phase, going right to the iterative phase. Therefore for each action we'd need to see plan for stakeholder involvement, setting objectives, ID alternatives, ID conceptual models, and develop monitoring. Instead of repeating work, the generalized program establishes the framework for all of these, and makes them consistent across actions.
- -Charlotte had indicated that Rec is planning to discuss the ROC LTO BA monitoring/AM "management vision" to the IEP directors on March 13. From the planning call for that meeting, Josh plans to present the PA and Appendix C. When asked about the 5-agency plan, Josh said that Rec would need to hear directly from NOAA that they do not endorse the BA approach and want to go with the 5-agency approach (we have told them that in pre-furlough meetings and . Seems the conversation was tense, as was the 2/27 "Focus Group" meeting with Dave Mooney.

That's all for now. Please let me know if you have any additional thoughts or questions.

Cathy

On Thu, Feb 28, 2019 at 11:18 AM Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <maria.rea@noaa.gov> wrote:

Howard tells me adaptive management will be the focus of the Directors call tomorrow. I'm happy to be a strong advocate for what we need.

Can one of you send me:

- the five agency adaptive management plan (appended to CWF)
- cut and paste of CWF terms and conditions re: adaptive management
- Reclamation PA cite on adaptive management - - is there something other than what is in PA, which I have with me?

Sorry I won't be in office between now and the call; let me know if any key points you want me to raise.

Thanks,
Maria

Sent from my iPad