

---

**From:** Howard Brown - NOAA Federal <howard.brown@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Sunday, May 26, 2019 10:37 AM  
**To:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** Yip, Garwin; Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal; Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal; Barbara Byrne - NOAA F... (Google Drive)  
**Subject:** Re: ROC LTO - Env Baseline in the BO

Brian and Naseem,

I have copied the DOI comment version of the EB section into the ROC drive in the Baseline folder of the ESA analysis and made numerous comments regarding their comments and suggested edits. Could one of you look at this now and edit the Master version accordingly? Clearly they are proposing a major WOA adjustment to our analysis, which I believe that we fundamentally disagree with so be very careful with how we address certain suggested edits and comments. As I mentioned earlier, I have a separate WOA insert section that documents Reclamation's perspective on this and I need to draft some very careful language about we have "layered" this into our BiOp.

Howard

U:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA\2.4 Environmental Baseline

On Sat, May 25, 2019 at 4:20 PM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
What Naseem said - happy to look at USBR comments on the EB if you want.

Howard,

What are your thoughts on keeping or removing the sentence below?

The Env Baseline in the BO states:

"This without action scenario is a useful analytical tool to separate some of the effects related to the existence of CVP and SWP facilities and provides context for how these facilities have shaped the habitat conditions for species and critical habitat in the action area."

Assuming we are not using WOA as a tool, shouldn't we delete that sentence? It seems unnecessary and begs the question, why didn't you use it if it is useful?

On Sat, May 25, 2019 at 4:55 PM Naseem Alston - NOAA Federal <[naseem.alston@noaa.gov](mailto:naseem.alston@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Sounds good, I'm happy to take a look at any sections to consider their comments...

On Saturday, May 25, 2019, Howard Brown - NOAA Federal <[howard.brown@noaa.gov](mailto:howard.brown@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Brian and Naseem,

How about I take a shot at managing some of the DOI comments on Baseline? I created a stand alone WOA section that basically reads like..."according to Reclamation..." Keifer is good with this approach and I hopeful we can put to rest some of this so that it doesn't end up taking over our biop.

H

On Fri, May 24, 2019 at 2:35 PM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:

The Env Baseline in the BO states:

"This without action scenario is a useful analytical tool to separate some of the effects related to the existence of CVP and SWP facilities and provides context for how these facilities have shaped the habitat conditions for species and critical habitat in the action area."

Assuming we are not using WOA as a tool, shouldn't we delete that sentence? It seems unnecessary and begs the question, why didn't you use it if it is useful?

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Howard L. Brown**

*Policy Advisor*

*NOAA Fisheries, West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

(916) 930-3608

[Howard.Brown@noaa.gov](mailto:Howard.Brown@noaa.gov)



[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

--

**Naseem O. Alston**

**ESA-Section 7 Coordinator/Fish Biologist**

**NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region**

**U.S. Department of Commerce**

**California Central Valley Office**

**Sacramento, CA**

**(916)930-3655**

<http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov/>

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Howard L. Brown**

*Policy Advisor*

*NOAA Fisheries, West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

(916) 930-3608

[Howard.Brown@noaa.gov](mailto:Howard.Brown@noaa.gov)



[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)