

---

**From:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, March 27, 2019 9:53 AM  
**To:** Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal  
**Subject:** Re: ROC Analytical Approach

Sorry for bombarding you when I'm sure everyone else is too, but so it goes.

I propose a new row for the magnitude table. See attached. Thick skin here, so feel free to shoot it down and I'll roll with it:)

On Tue, Mar 26, 2019 at 11:54 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Sounds good - table definitely helps! The issue with the Medium description is that it is silent on proportion exposed.

On Tue, Mar 26, 2019 at 11:49 AM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)> wrote:

There are definitely some overlaps in the general descriptions, so I do think it better to go to the table. I'll look at your suggestions when I do the next revision (after I get all reviews hopefully today) and see if we can make it clearer.

**Cathy Marcinkevage**  
*California Central Valley Office*  
*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
Office: (916) 930-5648  
Cell: (562) 537-8734  
[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)

On Mar 26, 2019, at 11:46 AM, Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:

I looked at the AA for magnitude definitions to use in the American River Effects section and noticed the general description of Medium magnitude seems to be missing a statement about proportion affected, or perhaps the severity should be short of lethal. The description seems too harsh to be "Medium". Based on the description, a lethal stressor that occurs at high frequency could be called "Medium" in terms of magnitude.

"Medium: Severity may range from lethal to minor, and frequency of exposure is generally high or medium."

One option for downgrading "Medium" is the following, although it does generate some overlap with the description for "Low".

"Severity may range from lethal to minor, **proportion exposed is medium or small**, and frequency of exposure is generally medium or small."

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)*

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)*

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)*