From: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, December 19, 2018 4:06 PM

To: Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal

Cc: Garwin Yip; Howard Brown; Maria Rea - NOAA Federal; Naseem.Alston

Subject: Re: Baseline Figures

You know, the more you look at this, the more you get sucked in to tweaking it, and thinking hard about it...

I've got a second version (Ver 2!) of the last two figures here that include revisions in response to Brian's comment and to conversation I heard at the tiger team meeting today. I'm sure not perfect and there are many ways to depict all of this, but it is another start. I can bring all version on Friday but I do think these are closer to our characterization than the first.

On Wed, Dec 19, 2018 at 2:43 PM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal < brian.ellrott@noaa.gov > wrote: Agreed. This is super helpful Cathy! See attached for a comment on the last figure. Feel free to call if you want to talk it over.

Brian

On Wed, Dec 19, 2018 at 2:11 PM Maria Rea - NOAA Federal < maria.rea@noaa.gov > wrote: Cathy, I would suggest bringing copies of this to the meeting on Friday. Thank you for working on this! - Maria

Maria Rea

Assistant Regional Administrator, California Central Valley Office NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region 650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100 Sacramento, CA 95814 (916) 930-3600 Maria.Rea@noaa.gov



On Wed, Dec 19, 2018 at 12:50 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal < cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov wrote:

A11 --

Earlier this morning, Garwin, Howard, Maria, and I talked about the baseline. We went back to the baseline figures from the OCAP and CWF opinions to try to visually ID how all of the parts layer on each other, and to show how their "without action" won't jive with what we need to do.

Attached is a document with all these together, including:

- -NMFS 2009 BiOp Figure
- -USFWS 2008 BiOp Approach
- -NMFS CWF Figure
- -My attempt to make a similar figure showing their "Without Action" baseline
- -My attempt to make a similar figure showing how we would tackle this in our BiOp

If we can nail down the last two, we thought that they could be good to have either 1) with us during our Friday "elevation" meeting with Paul and maybe 2) to include in the memo that is being drafted.

Off to chat more about it with Rec....but let me know what you think!

Cathy

--

Brian Ellrott

Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce

Mobile: 916-955-7628 Office: 916-930-3612 brian.ellrott@noaa.gov