From: Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <garwin.yip@noaa.gov>

Sent: Sunday, April 28, 2019 7:11 PM

To: j.stuart@noaa.gov

Cc: Howard Brown; Cathy Marcinkevage **Subject:** Fwd: ROC on LTO, Delta effects section

Jeff,

Please take a look at Maria's overarching comments, below, and in track changes, attached (author is NMFS), then let me know your ETA to get a revised draft back to me. Thanks.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814 Office: 916-930-3611 Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



----- Forwarded message -----

From: Maria Rea - NOAA Federal <maria.rea@noaa.gov>

Date: Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 3:52 PM

Subject: Re: ROC on LTO, Delta effects section

To: Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal < garwin.yip@noaa.gov>

Cc: Howard Brown < Howard. Brown@noaa.gov>, Cathy Marcinkevage < cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov>,

Susan Boring < susan boring@fws.gov >

Garwin et al -

This is certainly a thick section to get through, and a lot of work!

A few overarching comments -

- 1. I focused on how we characterized and analyzed changes in the PA from COS - in DCC, OMR flex, and lack of HOR, I:E. I skimmed a lot of other sections.
- 2. I think you need to find a consistent way in flagging changes from the COS, since they are part of the baseline. Its difficult to know where to do that structurally when whole actions are missing (I:E, HORB, Georgiana)

- 3. I would elect to bring in more figures and quoted sections from SST 2017 report - since widely accepted.
- 4. I would like Barb to review and edit the south delta hydrodynamics piece (in OMR) to make sure it is reflecting current science that she has been discussing on phone with John Watts and others
- 5. Its challenging to review with the text separated from the figures and data tables, but I was thinking I was going to see more of the recent model outputs that ICF has provided. Has that been included?
- 6. its not clear what is programmatic versus project specific analysis - that might help to organize and structure the detail in the section a bit more if time.

Thank you for the opportunity for early review - - good luck!

- Maria

Maria Rea
Assistant Regional Administrator, California Central Valley Office
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814
(916) 930-3600
Maria.Rea@noaa.gov

The bit and improvement the displayed. The file may these bear moved, remarked, or deleted both to the control file and boulers.
Find us online
FIIIU US OIIIIIIE
www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov
www.wcstcoast.nsncncs.noaa.gov
The first law page committee displayed. The first law page committee displaye
Season, or season, very market to produce the particular to produce th
*

On Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 1:28 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <<u>garwin.yip@noaa.gov</u>> wrote: Maria,

Attached is the Delta section, along with separate files for the figures and tables.

My next priority is to (try to) sleep in, then I will review the revised Clear Creek effects section sometime "tomorrow," but Sarah indicated that it still needs a lot of work.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region U.S. Department of Commerce California Central Valley Office 650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100 Sacramento, CA 95814

Office: 916-930-3611

Cell: 916-716-6558 FAX: 916-930-3629

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov

