
From: Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <garwin.yip@noaa.gov>
Sent: Sunday, June 2, 2019 5:54 PM
To: Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal
Cc: Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal; Howard Brown - NOAA Federal; J. Stuart - NOAA Federal
Subject: Re: Peer review document production

As discussed via text, we'll keep the inconsistent IOS numbers as presented, and CSI the inconsistency later. SRKW prey Appendix will not be part of peer review.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 2, 2019, at 4:55 PM, Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <barbara.byrne@noaa.gov> wrote:

I went in to the appendix document and the median changes that John reports cascades throughout multiple tables in his doc, so is not the relatively simple swap I thought it was (doing what I initially proposed will cause internal inconsistencies within the appendix). The swap is also less straightforward in Dan's effects doc because he includes a table with the inconsistent IOS numbers (and I'm not sure what the correct numbers should be).

Could we include in the note to reviewers something like "In recent internal review, NMFS has identified some inconsistencies in the summarization of the IOS model results (specifically, the relative change in spawner abundance between the PA and COS) between sections. We have not yet completed our assessment to determine how the inconsistencies arose but will address this issue prior to issuing the BiOp."

My guess is much of this inconsistency is how one (and the order in which one) calculates medians and averages and percents. Lots of ways to do the math for the same narrative description.

On Sun, Jun 2, 2019 at 4:38 PM Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov> wrote:

I'll assume that "Cathy's write up" of the LCM section. In that case the text was written by Evan based on analyses he did of results provided by Cramer. He's maybe just back in town. Probably not worth the frazzle to try to nail it down at this late point.

Cathy Marcinkevage
California Central Valley Office
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
Office: (916) 930-5648
Cell: (562) 537-8734
cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov

On Jun 2, 2019, at 4:32 PM, Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <barbara.byrne@noaa.gov> wrote:

Attached is my assessment of the IOS inconsistency (which took a while, involving three docs, several worksheets from John, and the IOS results which I've never looked at before). Bottom line is that I can't reproduce either the numbers in John's write-up or Cathy's write-up.

My recommendation, given the time crunch, is to grab Cathy's text to put into both the SRKW effects and SRKW appendix (updating version numbers on both) and that will provide consistency, if not correctness. We can try to chase down the sources of the numbers next week, and revert or change if needed.

On Sun, Jun 2, 2019 at 4:24 PM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal

<garwin.yip@noaa.gov> wrote:

Where'd you go? I thought you were working through the red flag IOS comment in the SRKW section and SRKW prey appendix.

Pens down was last night, so we don't have time for more reviews and addressing edits and comments, with few exceptions (e.g., peer review questions, Shasta).

American River effects is done. No calls, no walk through with Reclamation. They've reviewed and are OK.

Not sure what to make of the few appendix clean-up questions between you and Sarah, but the appendices were the first to be done.

-Garwin-

Garwin Yip

Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region
U.S. Department of Commerce
California Central Valley Office
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100
Sacramento, CA 95814
Office: 916-930-3611
Cell: 916-716-6558
FAX: 916-930-3629
www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



On Sun, Jun 2, 2019 at 4:00 PM Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal

<barbara.byrne@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi all, I'm back. Just responded to a few appendix clean-up questions from Sarah and (sort of...) caught up on e-mail. Whew, never a dull moment.

What should I help with? Is there time for me to take a stab at the American edits (since I was at the meeting on Friday, I have a sense of what DOI wants)? I would be willing to meet with Reclamation later today to go over comment by comment.

Let me know; will keep an eye on e-mail, but text the fastest way to alert me.

Barb

--

Barb Byrne

Fish Biologist

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

Office: 916-930-5612

barbara.byrne@noaa.gov

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814



Find us online

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov



<IOS consistency check.docx>

<IOS_results_summary_2_28_19_to check medians vs endings.xlsx>

--

Barb Byrne

Fish Biologist

NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region

U.S. Department of Commerce

Office: 916-930-5612

barbara.byrne@noaa.gov

California Central Valley Office

650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100

Sacramento, CA 95814



Find us online

www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov

