

---

**From:** Barbara Byrne - NOAA Federal <barbara.byrne@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Friday, June 7, 2019 4:16 PM  
**To:** Evan Sawyer - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** J. Stuart; Brian Ellrott; Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal; Sarah Gallagher - NOAA Federal; Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal; Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal  
**Subject:** Re: (v2) SWIFT RESPONSE REQUESTED: Peer Review Focus

For Delta --

- What are the panel's views on the sensitivity of the salvage data period on salvage-density model results? Is there a "best" data period that (for future consultations; not time to adjust for the current consultation) should be used to compare two different operational scenarios?
- What are the panel's views on the clarity of description/scientific support for NMFS's Delta conceptual model (top of the Delta effects section)?

On Fri, Jun 7, 2019 at 2:54 PM Evan Sawyer - NOAA Federal <[evan.sawyer@noaa.gov](mailto:evan.sawyer@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi All,

A follow up from Cathy's email yesterday and today's meeting with the peer-review panel where the panel reiterated the question:

Is there explicit guidance wrt just what models/approaches/analyses were that are of greatest interest to secure peer review?

Basically are there any hot topics that we would really like/need peer-review on?

Sarah identified the following on Clear Creek:

- "Are there significant risks or benefits that have been overlooked?", and
- "Are proposed flows and temperatures appropriate for the species?"

For Shasta I think a key issue is (Related to Panel Charge question #5):

5. Does the draft biological opinion adequately address data gaps and uncertainties? Specifically:

A. Are uncertainties and assumptions in the effects analysis clearly stated and reasonable based on current scientific knowledge?

- As it relates to Section 2.5.2.1 (specifically 2.5.2.1.2 Project Uncertainties)

Do any of the Division leads have other key topics that we would really like/need peer-review on?

Evan

--

Evan Bing Sawyer,  
Natural Resource Management Specialist  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (916) 930-3656  
[Evan.Sawyer@noaa.gov](mailto:Evan.Sawyer@noaa.gov)

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

**Barb Byrne**

Fish Biologist

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Office: 916-930-5612

[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)

*California Central Valley Office*

*650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100*

*Sacramento, CA 95814*



**Find us online**

[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

